Fachbereich Politik- und Verwaltungswissenschaft

Universität Konstanz

Representation and Replication

C. Breunig and B. Guinaudeau

christian.breunig@uni.kn benjamin.guinaudeau@uni.kn

Summer Term 2021

1 Statement of purpose

The purpose of this course is (1) to deepen the understanding of political representation, (2) to develop applicable skills for assessing quantitative research designs in political science, and (3) to present and communicate research findings effectively.

This class is an opportunity to learn the practical aspects of research in political science. The substantive focus is on comparative works of representation. We can understand and evaluate empirical scholarship on representation by knowing fully how data were generated and analyzed. Following this dictum, we briefly review core concepts of representation and then learn about and conduct reproducible research. We implement recommendations on transparency, methodological standards, as well as pre-registration and data analysis in order to replicate empirical research on political representation.

2 General Information

- **Time:** Tuesday 15:15 until 16:45
- **Class:** Online (`https://tinyurl.com/y5xuwc7z`)
- **Slack:** `https://tinyurl.com/3ppdzm`
- **Ilias-Password:** Mansbridge2021

2.1 Mail/Slack

We try to answer your Emails in two working day. If you did not hear back after two days, please send a kind reminder.

2.2 Citations and Plagiarism

Please follow the citation rule as defined by the department. We highly recommend using bibliography management software. Plagiarism is not tolerated and is automatically be graded with 5,0. For more information, please visit the department website.

3 Assignments

This course is highly interactive, collaborative and modular. The objective is to produce a replication study of a peer-reviewed article from the academic literature on political representation. This task is carried out in small groups. The final submission will be prepared relying on four smaller assignments. As such, assignments build on each other, and the completion of each assignment is necessary for passing the course. All assignments must be submitted as a pdf-file by Monday at noon in the week that they are due.

Assignments submitted after the deadline automatically receive a failing grade.

3.1 Exercise in R - April, 20th

The first assignment assesses the technical skills required for this course. R-code and write-up are due before the second session.

3.2 Choice of paper - May, 4th

The second assignment consists of a summary of two papers, which could be replicated by students. Students can pick any paper that meets the three following criteria:

- peer-reviewed publication dealing political representation
- data used in the paper is available
- empirical strategy of the paper is understood and reasonably implementable by students

3.3 Paper critique (1500 words) - June, 1st

This assignment entails a critical appraisal of a particular study. After summarising the main elements of the study (research question, theoretical argument and empirical strategy), students must critically evaluate each aspect of the study and discuss the extent to which the conclusion of the study might be misleading, exaggerated or inadequate.

3.4 Pre-Analysis Plan - PAP (1000 words) - June, 15th

The PAP is an assignment, which takes the form of a replication recipe (Brandt et al., 2013 ; https://osf.io/4jd46/) following the template of the Open Science foundation. The plan should include a detailed presentation of the empirical strategy of the replication study.

3.5 Poster-Conference (20 minute presentation) - July, 13th/20th

Each participant presents their replication and receive feedback during an an online poster conference in the last two weeks of the course.

3.6 Term Paper (4500 words)

The term paper is a replication study comprising each of the three previous assignments. The paper should be structured in three parts: (1) critical appraisal of the replicated paper ; (2) technical explanation on how the replication was conducted ; (3) presentation of the results and discussion of their implication for the conclusion drawn from the original study. Although the computation might be run as a group, the term paper is written individually.

Summary

Exercise in R		April, 20th
Paper choice		May, 4th
Paper critic	**15%**	June, 1st
PAP	**15%**	June, 15th
Poster	**10%**	July, 13th
Term Paper	**60%**	September, 30th

4 Main Literature

- Mansbridge, J. (2003). Rethinking Representation. *American Political Science Review*, 515-528.
- Janz, N., & Freese, J. (2020). Replicate Others as You Would Like to Be Replicated Yourself. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 1-4.
- Bergstrom, C. T., & West, J. D. (2020). *Calling bullshit: the art of skepticism in a data-driven world*. Random House.

5 Learning Objectives

1. Overview of literature on representation
2. Evaluations of research designs
3. Data collection and data analysis
4. Efficient communication of research work

6 Program

Class 1 - Introduction   **13/04/2021**

Class 2 - What is Representation?   **20/04/2021**

Weßels, B. (2007). *Political Representation and Democracy*

Mansbridge, J. (2003). Rethinking Representation. *American Political Science Review*, 97(4):515–528

Powell, G. B. (2004). Political Representation in Comparative Politics. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 7(1):273–296

Class 3 - What is replication?   **27/04/2021**

Elman, C., Kapiszewski, D., and Lupia, A. (2018). Transparent Social Inquiry: Implications for Political Science. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 21(1):29–47

King, G. (1995). Replication, Replication. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 28(3):444–452

Class 4 - What should we replicate?   **04/05/2021**

Stockemer, D., Koehler, S., and Lentz, T. (2018). Data Access, Transparency, and Replication: New Insights from the Political Behavior Literature. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 51(4):799–803

Breznau, N. (2015). The Missing Main Effect of Welfare State Regimes: A Replication of 'Social Policy Responsiveness in Developed Democracies' by Brooks and Manza. *Sociological Science*, 2:420–441

Höhmann, D. and Tober, T. (2017). Electoral Rules and Partisan Control of Government: A Replication Study. *The Journal of Politics*, 80(1):342–347

Class 5 - When is replication useful?   11/05/2021

Janz, N. and Freese, J. (2021). Replicate Others as You Would Like to Be Replicated Yourself. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 54(2):305–308

King, G. (2006). Publication, Publication. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 39(1):119–125

Huntington-Klein, N., Arenas, A., Beam, E., Bertoni, M., Bloem, J., Burli, P. H., Chen, N., Grieco, P. L., Ekpe, G., Pugatch, T., et al. (2020). The influence of hidden researcher decisions in applied microeconomics

Class 6 - What is a pre-analysis plan?   18/05/2021

Brandt, M. J., IJzerman, H., Dijksterhuis, A., Farach, F. J., Geller, J., Giner-Sorolla, R., Grange, J. A., Perugini, M., Spies, J. R., and van 't Veer, A. (2014). The Replication Recipe: What makes for a convincing replication? *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 50:217–224

Ofosu, G. K. and Posner, D. N. Pre-Analysis Plans: An Early Stocktaking. *Perspectives on Politics*

Nosek, B. A., Ebersole, C. R., DeHaven, A. C., and Mellor, D. T. (2018). The preregistration revolution. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(11):2600–2606

Class 7 - RAW (read, analyze & write)   25/05/2021

Class 8 - Holiday   01/06/2021

Class 9 - How can we assess credibility?   08/06/2021

Wickham, H. (2021). *The tidyverse style guide*

Wilson, G., Bryan, J., Cranston, K., Kitzes, J., Nederbragt, L., and Teal, T. K. (2017). Good enough practices in scientific computing. *PLOS Computational Biology*, 13(6):e1005510

Class 10 - What is your replication strategy?   15/06/2021

Class 11 - RAW   22/06/2021

Class 12 - RAW   29/06/2021

Class 13 - How can results be presented & disseminated effectively?   6/07/2021

Bergstrom, C. T. (2021). *Calling Bullshit: the art of skepticism in a data-driven world.*

Class 14 - Poster Conference   13/07/2021

Class 15 - Poster Conference   20/07/2021